
Kevin Law: Alright folks if any of you are new here and haven't been with us since 8:00 this morning, just a couple of ground rules.

First my name is Kevin Law and I am the Chairman of the Gaming Location Board. To my left is Paul Francis, to my right is Dennis Glazer. And we have gone through 112 speakers already today. Everybody who signed up will not be heard tonight. We are ending at 8:00 p.m. We'll do the best we can. If to the extent you can go quick, that means more of your neighbors and colleagues can also speak. But what we're doing, working off of two lists, a list of people who pre-registered on the website over the last few weeks, and then people who signed up today. And people who signed up today, we'll get to as many as we can but I can assure you we won't get to everybody and I apologize for that. We will hold you to 5 minutes, and again if you can speak less than 5 minutes that would be terrific, it means more of you can speak and with that we're going to get right back to the program. And the first speaker up is Michele Lindsay.

Michele Lindsay: I am Michele Lindsay and I have lived in Tuxedo Park for 20 years. Thank you for your hard work and the opportunity to speak tonight. I vehemently opposed the casino in the very heart of Sterling Forest State Park. The primary reason to reject Genting's proposal is that the casino will cause permanent irreparable damage to the fragile environment of both Sterling Forest and Harriman State Parks. I strongly believe that the stewardship and leadership shown by the Palisades Interstate Park Commission, as they continue to protect these parks must be supported and upheld. It is critical to remember that Sterling Forest was preserved to protect the watershed for millions of residents in New York and New Jersey. I urge you to drive through Sterling Forest in Tuxedo. You will see that our topography cannot support the overwhelming increase in traffic, noise, air and light pollution that would come with the casino. This is an inappropriate place to allow a massive complex with 7 million visitors annually.

Secondly, legal roadblocks will delay and likely will defeat this massive development. Already an Article 78 has been filed against the Tuxedo town board for their mishandling of the zoning change to allow gaming. More lawsuits will be forthcoming as the Tuxedo town board has mishandled the seeker review process.

Another major roadblock is the unanimous decision by the Palisades Interstate Park Commissioners to deny access to the land and road that Genting needs to build Exit 15B. The Tuxedo town board has repeatedly affirmed that the casino project cannot be built without Exit 15B. And there are other important reasons to reject Genting's Casino. Genting has claimed that there will be minimal environmental impact because the property had been previously disturbed, when in fact; it was only a private runway. To build a 1.5 million square foot casino resort, they will need to blast, and drastically disturb the site. Genting claims that they are working with environmental groups. Yes these very groups have written letters in vehement opposition and their position has not changed. The residents of Tuxedo are deeply divided on this issue by an overwhelming margin of 2 to 1 as evidenced by letters sent to the Board and speakers at public hearings. The Tuxedo town board's agreement with Genting requires them to support the casino in order to receive the promised 47.5 million dollars. This clause should have prevented them

from declaring themselves lead agency in the seeker review. Furthermore, during the scoping session, the Tuxedo town board rejected 1/3 of the concerns submitted by the Village of Tuxedo Park Board. A major factor in the selection process is the ability of the project to be completed in the state mandated timeframe. Genting does not have an alternative plan for a thruway exit and it will take months, if not years, to engineer and get approvals for a new designed exit.

And when considering the economic benefit that Genting claims will come from their clients in the Asian market, one must think what will happen when casinos open in New York City? The casino resolution misled the voters to believe the casinos would be in economically depressed areas. State Senator Bonacic who helped to write the legislation has spoken out saying that Orange County was not the intended location.

In closing I would like to reiterate the reason I think is the most important one to consider as expressed by Governor George Pataki when the creation of Sterling Forest was completed. He said, "By working together we have created an incredible state park for generations of New Yorkers to hike its trails, gaze over its scenic vistas and enjoy the peaceful sounds of the forest. At the same time, we are continuing to protect drinking water for millions of New York and New Jersey residents." Thank you.

Kevin Law: Thank you Michele. Dennis Trada. Dennis

Dan Rochelle: My name is Dan Rochelle and I'll be taking Dennis' spot. Good evening, as I said before my name is Dan Rochelle. I'm an attorney with the Natural Resources Defense Council, a national environmental organization that has worked for more than four decades in New York on regional issues and has been heavily engaged in the casino siting issues in the state since 2001. We appreciate the opportunity to present this brief statement today.

In short, NRDC is very concerned over the possible siting of multiple casinos in the Catskills region of Sullivan County, and the proposal for a sprawling, heavily trafficked casino complex in the middle of Sterling Forest State Park. The Catskills and Highlands Regions are two of the most treasured and integral natural areas in the Eastern United State. Both are home to pristine waterways, spectacular vistas and an incredible diversity of wildlife. And because of their proximity to some of the most populous areas in the state, they present unequalled opportunities for recreation such as hunting, hiking, camping and world renown trout fishing. Importantly, both regions are also vital components of major watershed areas that provide millions of people with fresh drinking water every day. In particular, the Catskills comprise the bulk of the New York City watershed delivering high quality, unfiltered water to over 9 million people and the 21,000 plus acre Sterling Forest State Park in the middle of the Highlands region forms a significant unspoiled portion of the Ramapo River watershed which serves more than 4.5 million people in New York and New Jersey.

While NRDC takes no position on gambling, for more than a decade we have actively opposed the siting of major Las Vegas style casino facilities in ecologically sensitive areas of the state. Among the proposals now before the Location Board, we raise two chief concerns:

First, NRDC opposes the siting of multiple casinos in Sullivan County because of the cumulative environmental injuries this clustering would bring to the heart of the Catskills region including increased traffic, impairment of air and water quality, and ancillary sprawl development. While many of the casino proposals in Sullivan County have been withdrawn from the application pool, we emphasize that the clustering of multiple casinos in Sullivan County would be plainly unacceptable and strongly opposed either now or in the future. Further, we note that siting more than one casino in Sullivan County would trigger supplemental environmental review requirements that heretofore have not been assessed in any environmental review documents that we have seen.

Second, NRDC opposes the proposal by Genting Americas to build a mammoth facility, a 1.4 million square foot complex with a 1000 room hotel and a 50,000 square foot gaming floor and 7000 parking spaces in the center of Sterling Forest State Park. We recognize and appreciate the developer's assurances to NRDC and other stakeholders that all possible efforts will be made to minimize the environmental impacts of this facility. However, despite these good faith intentions for a sprawling commercial facility designed to attract 7 million people annually, most of them by car, in the middle of a largely pristine wilderness does not constitute environmentally responsible development. By design, Sterling Forest simply is an inappropriate location for a massive casino and resort complex even if the project would, to a degree, include some environmental mitigation and green design features.

Before concluding, I'll note that just last week the Palisades Interstate Park Commission confirmed that allowing the use of the forest land to facilitate this casino is patently incompatible with its mission to preserve the forest's scenic beauty and natural resources when it unanimously denied the use of any commissioned property for the furtherance of this casino project. This includes Route 106, a vital access road to the proposed project area. If not a practical death knell for this ill-conceived proposal, the Commission's overwhelming rejection adds to the considerable legal hurdles now faced by the developers. Without elaborating, I will briefly note that from the materials we have been able to review to date, the projects legal deficiencies among others likely include the failure to adequately consider impacts from increased traffic, impermissible segmentation of review of a new proposed thruway interchange, and inadequate consideration of the effect of projected water withdrawals on local drinking water resources.

In sum, we hope that the Location Board fully weighs the unique and invaluable importance of the Catskills and Highlands region by ensuring that these treasured areas will be protected from inappropriate development. Thank you.

Kevin Law: Dan a question? Your comments on the Catskills, I understand them to include Mohegan Sun and Montreign cause they are the ones that are close together. Does it also include the Nevele Project?

Dan Rochelle: The Nevele is not in Sullivan County I don't believe.

Kevin Law: That's correct but its in the Catskills.

Dan Rochelle: We opposed the clustering of casinos in Sullivan County.

Kevin Law: Sullivan County. And how about the other 6, the other 5 proposals?

Dan Rochelle: The Orange County proposals?

Kevin Law: The other 5 Orange County proposals.

Dan Rochelle: We don't take a position on the other Orange County proposals.

Kevin Law: Have you studied those?

Dan Rochelle: I have not studied all of those, but we take a position on the Sterling Forest proposal and we oppose it.

Kevin Law: What caused you to study Sterling Forest and not the others?

Dan Rochelle: I mean, it's a large casino facility in the middle of a forest that has been sort of decades in the making and I believe the state and private investors and other folks who have spent over 100 million dollars in protecting...

Kevin Law: That's not my question. My question is what caused you to take a position on it?

Dan Rochelle: Oh, well I mean, we've had a history of opposing inappropriate development in protected natural areas. We're an environmental organization.

Kevin Law: It didn't come to your attention through any of the groups? It came to your attention independently?

Dan Rochelle: Well, well no I mean I guess it was sort of both methods. I mean we're looped into the New York Scene so if there's these sort of proposals are sort of common knowledge.

Kevin Law: Okay thanks.

Dan Rochelle: Thank you.

Kevin Law: Peter Bush.

Peter Bush: Peter Bush, Tuxedo, New York. I'll keep my comments brief because my fellow residents have covered everything very clearly, the last two speakers.

Residents of Tuxedo were advised during many public meetings including a 3-hour duration public scoping session on July 31st of this year that the Genting Sterling Forest Casino Project would be subject to an extensive and thorough seeker process given the highly unique properties of the significant contiguous forest, aquifer eco system that is Sterling Forest. At the Albany Gaming Presentation, Genting announced that an expedited seeker process will be completed by December 31st of this year. It is incredulous to have any party in this entire sorted gaming site process suggest or support that an environmental impact study of incredibly short duration is acceptable when critical water, plant, animal, socioeconomic and traffic studies must be inherent in a long-term study of at least four seasons given the specificity and importance of Sterling Forest. As has already been stated, 16 years ago on a nonpartisan effort to provide drinking water for millions of New York and New Jersey residents, it is a contiguous forest. Every part of this process has been met by scrambling to Genting scrambling to counteract comments made during the scoping session up to and including that they're going to build a self-sustaining reclamation facility without any specificity of gallons of use per day or potable water, etc. The entire process has not in fact been transparent.

The last issue I want to address is the term gifting. It is completely offensive to me as an American citizen that the casino developer and by turn, the state of New York permits the process of gifting in this community. 300,000 to the local school board, the Mayor of Greenwood Lake was put on the Genting payroll as a Public Relations Advocate. The typical hubris of the gaming license process ended in Albany with them stating they're ready to write a check for 450 million to the New York State Gaming Commission. Too bad the Moreland Commission was disbanded shortly before news of casinos in Orange County was announced.

With the Meadowlands being fast tracked for similar Genting style complex close to New York City it is clear that the saturation of casinos in New York do not a sustainable economic revenue stream make. To sacrifice Sterling Forest to Genting Corporation is an attack on a major environmental region and, to my way of thinking, democracy in the United States of America. Thank you.

Kevin Law: Paul Ruggeria

Paul Ruggeria: It's my honor to speak in front of all you on this historical day. My name is Paul Ruggeria. I'm a town of Newburg resident, councilman, taxpayer and business owner in the town of Newburg. I'm in full support of the casino proposed on Route 17K, town of Newburg and so is my fellow board members. This location is definitely the best site in Orange County. Due to the location to Route 84, the New York State Thruway bordering two sides of the property and 17K as being the main entrance. This is why the town of Newburg is called the Crossroads of the Northeast. Also, there is no housing developments nearby to cause this casino any problems.

Kevin Law: Which one is it? Give us a name.

Paul Ruggieria: This is Hudson Valley, Saratoga sorry. This location, the combined Newburg large city school tax, Wallkill school tax, Valley Central school tax and Marlboro Central school tax has risen 63.2% since 1999. The town of Newburg is very unique there. We have 4 school districts in one town basically. By placing a casino in the town of Newburg, this would alleviate the school taxes in all four school districts. Saratoga Gaming will be giving 10 million a year to the Newburg school district. The Marlboro school district, the Wallkill school district and the Valley Central school district will each be given 125,000 per year. I feel this is a huge to all taxpayers in the town of Newburg.

The other locations in Orange County are only hitting one school district and those districts are rich compared to the Newburg school district. This year the Newburg school district received a grant to bring back their pre-K program that was eliminated 5 years ago because of lack of funds. This is a great thing, but the grant is only for five years. What will happen then? The funds that the Newburg school district will receive every year from Saratoga will definitely keep that needed program in place.

We also signed a historical joint agreement between the town of Newburg and the City of Newburg to give part of our host money to the City of Newburg for public safety only. This will allow the City of Newburg to place more police on the street in such a crime-ridden area. This is a win for the City of Newburg and the town since both our borders touch. Saratoga Gaming will also be giving funds to the City of Newburg for repairs to infrastructure which is desperately needed. I also worked for the City of Newburg for 24 years with the Public Works and the Traffic Division so I know how important this money is for the City of Newburg. Please look at these facts that I said when deciding location of where the casino will be placed. The town of Newburg, the school districts and the city of Newburg desperately need this boost. Thank you.

Kevin Law: Thank you Paul. Excuse me Paul, Paul, do you happen to know off hand what is the total school budget in Newburg?

Paul Ruggieria: I don't have that number off hand.

Kevin Law: Thank you. Steve Carrizo.

Steve Carrizo: Hello I'm Steve Carrizo. Thanks for your time tonight. Actually I'm here to talk about the Montgomery Project more which seems to have so much less resistance, so much less controversy. The area can really use the influx of money for sure. I mean we're in between Newburg, Middletown, Walton, all these towns that can definitely use jobs. I don't see traffic problems, 747 is empty most of the time going to Stewart Airport. So that's one of my main points tonight. And Genting is also offering to bring in lots of jobs, higher paying jobs, health insurance, etc. so I see this is the path of least resistance and that's my point tonight.

Kevin Law: Well thank you. And we welcome you straight and to the point. Thank you very much. Okay now we move to the other list of people who signed up today. Michael Sessman.

Michael Sessman: Good evening gentleman and thank you for the opportunity to address you this evening. Just by way of brief background, I'm an attorney in the region, have been since 1985. I had the privilege in the last 6 months of bringing a lawsuit regarding the Tuxedo development on behalf of 18 plaintiffs which you've heard about and which I won't repeat. If you have any questions about that lawsuit, I'll obviously answer them.

I ran for County Executive of Orange County in 2001 and have been deeply involved in the politics of our region for many years. I started empowering centers in Ellenville 3 years ago, funded them myself so the people of Ellenville could have a place to go and congregate because the level of destituteness in that community is extraordinary. We did the same thing in Port Jervis recently because again government in our region has largely failed to meet the needs of people.

I've heard individuals get up here and speak about Orange County, and as I said, I ran for County Executive of our county and have a deep interest in the affairs of our county. But the realities of life are that there has been no political mandate given by the voters of our county for casinos in the county. I say that for this reason, when this matter came before the public in November of 2013 for a referendum, there was absolutely no discussion our county. None whatsoever. That one of the purposes of this referendum was to place casinos in Orange County. In fact, the local state officials said the opposite that the sole purpose for the inclusion of Orange County, and it is included in certain language was to facilitate the transfer of money to our county from casinos which it was conceded would be located outside of our county in Sullivan and perhaps Ulster County. That was the text of the discussion. That was the public debate. There was no public debate, none whatsoever about placing a casino in our county and no expectation that that would happen. In fact, in fact, our budget was always viewed for years and years as highly favorable. It would point out this morning we're the second fastest growing county in the state for 20 years. Now I represented the NAACP 27 years in the Yonkers Litigation. I had an office in Newburg. I was Chairman of the Newburg Community Action Committee which is the antipoverty agency in the City of Newburg and I have a deep commitment to urban issues as my career shows. Newburg needs a significant program of economic development which does not depend on the introduction into that community of additional pathology. The problem with casino gambling, as we all know, is it's a matter of last resort. Sullivan County has made a choice over the last 20 years or 30 years to advocate for casino gambling because they have no other way to proceed. The City of Newburg is contiguous to West Point, to a major airport. There are numerous economic opportunities in the City of Newburg. We've had failed political leadership in our county for 40 years with no emphasis on the redevelopment of the City of Newburg. And therefore you have a Mayor and you have others who come and say the only way forward for Newburg is a casino. Nonsense. The way forward for Newburg is a jobs program which rebuilds the 560 crumbling buildings in the city and that can be done and should be done with state support. So the notion of what we need to do in Newburg is have a casino which will solve all the problems of that community is fallacious in my view.

On the other hand, Sullivan County and Ulster County clearly have infrastructure which is created for destination resorts and on the table now are such resorts are the Nevele in my view

and the Concord which I believe are the two principle projects which you should support. You should support them because it's true to the legislative history, it's true to the referendum that was passed, it's necessary in this case to view this regionally. There may be many people in the county disappointed that I don't support a casino somewhere in the county, but I know that if you put a casino somewhere in Orange County, it will act as an absolute block to the successful operation, financing development of a casino beyond our county. And we cannot afford that block if we view this regionally. If we view this regionally, we must sacrifice if that be necessary for Orange County. We have many other ways of developing our county because it has the arterials that it has. Because we have Woodbury Common. Because we have West Point. Because we have Newburg Waterfront. We have many other ways of proceeding. These other counties do not. This is truly their last fair chance. Thank you.

Kevin Law: Thank you. Next is Michael Durso. Michael. Keith Garley.

Keith Garley: Hello my name is Keith Garley. I'm not a lifetime resident of Orange County. I came here in 1959 and I started kindergarten in Greenwood Lake. Almost. I had the privilege of working in Sterling Forest when it was a garden center ski area. It was a family oriented place, it was a beautiful place, my mother worked there. Genting is offering to bring that gardens back. We had royalty from Europe to visit that garden site that's how beautiful it was. I don't think anybody on either side of this room could state that that would be a negative thing to happen to that area. This is not just about a gambling casino. This happens to be about fixing something that needs to be fixed. The town of Tuxedo is in financial distress, they need this revenue. Greenwood Lake needs this revenue. Some people here think that \$50 thousand is not a good starting salary. I think they ought to take their head out of the sand and visit reality because I have 20 year olds still living at home looking for work. I have 4 children, 2 of them had to move out of the area. Now I'm a retired Police Officer New York City, my esteem colleague from Sullivan County had a 10-point list, I have a 5-point list: Number 1 is location. Number 2 and 3 are location, location. That is a great business motto and that's how you start a business. Number 4 is the ability to operate with profit. Number 5 is to be able to last and exist. We don't want another Atlantic City casino that's only here 2 years. Just look at that map. We're talking about traffic. Northern New Jersey, Westchester, New York City and Long Island. What is the closest point? Its right there, Sterling Forest. You alleviate the traffic by getting it off the highway not continue it all the way up to Sullivan County. I feel very bad for Sullivan County. I think they ought to get one of the casinos but I don't think you should put all your eggs in one basket. This is something new. I think Southern New York, Southern Orange County should have one and the Catskills should have one. Let's face it, this is something that we've never done before. If you go ahead and put both casinos in a distanced area from New York City in bad weather, how are the customers going to get there? The roads are treacherous enough. They're going to be using this corridor to get there. All the emergency service for accidents are going to not be paid for. All these communities, all the way to Sullivan County, every time there's an accident we have to respond to it. Who's going to pay for that? Some of this money has to be filtered into the Southern part of Orange County.

I've been a Ford employee, I've worked all over. Thank God I passed the test and I have a nice pension now. I operate a marina in Greenwood Lake. We need this exit. We're waiting 30 years next year for this exit. Our governor Mario Cuomo signed it in '85. We have not had that exit yet. There's no funding. We have the opportunity for that exit. It's far beyond Tuxedo's Parks locked gates. Their community that they lock themselves away in. There's other communities around that need this help. Surrounding towns they take our school taxes, we have nothing to say about it. We're the majority in the high school. I strongly urge you to consider the Sterling Forest area. The Genting people have responded to every opposition and tried to help. They call it buying. They're trying to help, they're good neighbors. And I strongly ask you to consider this location for those main reasons, financially and the location, and the ability to stay open and not close in 2 years. Thank you very much.

Kevin Law: Bernie Faith.

Bernie Faith: I want to thank you for the day off today. But anyway, Keith has said a lot of the things which I feel. I own a small business in Greenwood Lake. I don't have a war story about my parents in Orange County or Sullivan County or whatever like that, it's not where I was brought up but I've had a business in Greenwood Lake for the past 10 years. In Greenwood Lake we can use the casinos, we can use the dollars from it. I have at least 2 people a day coming into my business looking for work, people that want to work. They're not looking for million dollar jobs. They're not looking for, all they want to do is take care of their family or take care of themselves. I hire as many people as I can and try to work it out cause I do feel for my community and I love it for the time that I've been there. And if feel that the Genting Group is different to what other people believe are trying to do the right thing and the reason why I feel it should be in Tuxedo is the Newburg and other places are saying, "Well our sewers are broken." Greenwood Lake doesn't even have a sewer. It's all about education. Greenwood Lake doesn't even have a high school. We've got to send them down to Tuxedo and a portion of my property taxes goes to pay to run the Tuxedo High School. And Greenwood Lake has more kids in that school than Tuxedo does. And as far as the people from Tuxedo Park, God bless them, they don't have to worry about the same things we have to worry about. I wasn't saying anything when you were up here okay.

Kevin Law: Whoa. I'm not going to get into your time. Folks we've gone through 250 speakers, I'm not going to lose control of the meeting now. We've asked you to treat each other with respect. We're listening to everybody and everybody's getting a chance. We're hearing both sides. Let the gentleman finish.

Bernie Faith: Thank you I appreciate that. So it is needed in that area. It will help out and as Keith said, we need staying power. I don't know what goes on in Sullivan County. I don't know why its taken 40 years for them to get things together or not get things together to wait upon a casino to get there. I don't have that expertise, you gentleman have it, but if any casino in any of this area is going to succeed it's going to be in that location because it is very accessible to everybody. Sullivan County is at least another hour away from where Tuxedo is and Tuxedo is right on the border. It can compete. What Genting wants to put there will compete with the

Meadowlands. It will compete with New York City because it's not just a casino, it's a resort. We're rebuilding the Sterling Forest. They're going to redo the ski area. They're going to continue to do with Renaissance Fair and keep the hours more going there. I think it's a no-brainer but you know, and I would hope that you're not going to take the threats from some people about lawsuits and so forth to defer you from making the right decision. My feeling the right decision is the Sterling Forest Resort. Thank you very much for your time.

Kevin Law: Latasha Cotton.

Latasha Cotton: Good evening I'm going to split my time with Chief Vater. I don't know where he is at this moment. Chief Vater. You guys said you didn't want to hear the same rhetoric over and over right. So I'm gonna say this to you. I am one of the strongest grassroots economic development, community development and youth development advocates in the City of Newburg. I'm tired of hustling for the children to have something. I'm taking from Peter to pay Paul. I mean I'm grabbing from air, I'm breathing on fumes. Our children could really use the \$10 million. I mean I've done everything from movies to parades in the City of Newburg. This thing that we're looking for to come to the City of Newburg is a stronger movement. Myself and one of the George Garrison, which is a part of the Department of Public Works, we're combining mentals right now to try to figure out a way to fix the structure of the City of Newburg. Because if you ride through, it's like being at Great Adventures. So we need \$1.3 million for the infrastructure. We need that. If you guys have seen anything, the news or anything, we need that money in the City of Newburg. Not only that but the market place is a flat surface. You don't have to do anything but build, meaning that it would go up a lot quicker. You understand. So I'm for Newburg united. I'm for this casino at this place because it is very vital right now in the City of Newburg for us to have these things available. You guys have no idea. I am so tired of hustling so that those children can have something. I'm tired of hustling so that the streets can remain just safe. I'm tired of being neighborhood patrol. I'm not the police. You know what I'm saying, but I'm neighborhood patrol. I'm out there fighting with little kids. I'm out there fighting with grownups who are fighting grownups who have guns. I don't carry a gun, but I'm not scary. Do you understand what I'm saying to you guys? We actually really need. There was a 75% hit on us guys. It has taken everybody down. We actually need you.

Kevin Law: Chief you've got the remainder of 2 minutes.

Chief Vater: Good evening gentleman. Thank you for hearing me. My name is Michael Vater and I'm the Fire Chief and Director of Emergency Management for the city of Newburg. I'm also the Chairman of the Newburg Community Land Bank and speaking to you in support of the Hudson Valley Casino and Resort. Newburg is at the crossroads both figuratively and literally. Newburg is called the crossroads of the Northeast in terms of transportation and access, yet the City of Newburg is at the crossroads of its survival. The City of Newburg alone has a population that is nearly half that of Sullivan County and almost 28% of the cities population lives at or below the poverty line as compared to 17% in all of Sullivan County.

Accordingly there is nearly the same number of poverty-stricken individuals alone in the City of Newburg as there are in Sullivan County. Expressed in another way, there are 2,368 people in poverty in the City of Newburg, compared to 13 people per square mile in the county of Sullivan. If one of the guiding tenants of siting a casino's impact on distressed communities, I argue that the Newburg area casino would have the greatest impact of all the proposed sites. Next there is the question of smart growth. The City of Newburg in conjunction with the town of Newburg as more than enough infrastructure capacity to handle the needs of the Hudson Valley Resort and Casino. If part of the siting equation includes smart growth, then Newburg is their place. It's the only site near any of the urban centers of the Hudson Valley.

As noted earlier, I'm the Chair of the Newburg Land Bank. Our mission is to put 600 buildings back on the tax rolls. This project will help us create the waters to warehouse link going from the Newburg Ferry to the warehouses in Montgomery.

And then lastly, I'd like to talk about emergency services. That's the one that nobody wants to talk about. In the Newburg area there are more staffed career professional firefighters and police offices than any place in the valley. Thank you.

Kevin Law: Thank you. Jacob Matthews.

Jacob Matthews: Good evening. First I'd like to say this is the most amazing t-shirt contest I have ever been to in my life. It's really impressive. I want to thank Mr. Francis and Chairman Law and Mr. Glazer and Mr. Thompson, who I believe is not here now, for their volunteer work on this Board. You have a grave responsibility to the people of the State of New York and you deserve a pat on the back for taking up this effort. I'll try to be brief.

My name is Jacob Matthews, I live at 87 Pine Road in Tuxedo Park, New York. I'm speaking as a concerned resident. I'm not affiliated with any particular group and I'm speaking in complete and total opposition to the proposed Genting Resort in Tuxedo and in Sterling Forest. This resort is completely out of character with the area. I'm pretty much a life-long resident of Tuxedo. I was born on Warwick, New York. My family is from the area and aside from begin in Boston and New York City for over 14 years, I'm back in Tuxedo to raise a family. I moved to Tuxedo because it's quiet, it's wooded, I love the outdoors and it should remain that way. That's what it was intended for. So in November I voted, no, to casinos because I think they're a complete drain on society. I do not believe they contribute anything meaningful to the development of our people or to our nation. That's my person view on it.

As far as locating a casino, Tuxedo is the wrong place for both economic and environmental reasons. I believe the Board here has an ethical responsibility. The Siting Board has an ethical responsibility to place the casinos where there is the greatest economic need for individuals living in those communities. That should be based on income analysis and unemployment numbers. The problems Tuxedo has are nothing compared to the problems you have in the other communities north of Tuxedo. That is the Catskills and the cities of Orange County. Tuxedo's problems are nothing. I'm a life-long resident there, I have my finger on the pulse of things and

it's a joke compared to what's going on elsewhere. Other areas really need this if there is any use for casinos, it could be a shot in the arm for those places. Jobs, Tuxedo has close access to Rocklin, Bergen and Westchester for jobs. Tuxedo residents have many more job opportunities within a close drive, 20 to 30 minute commute. We're closer to Rocklin, Westchester, Bergen County and a relatively short commute by both bus and train to Manhattan giving us an opportunity at jobs at corporate headquarters in thousands of bustling small and midsize companies. Sullivan County residents do not have access to this job market. Community need, economically areas such as Sullivan and Newburg need the jobs much more than we do. Tuxedo and Sterling Forest and Harriman State Park are a greenbelt, the Hudson Highlands. This is a heritage area. Disturbing it for a casino is wrong and would be an injustice to residents of our state into future generations. Harriman State Park and Sterling Forest form an important greenbelt, to the north it's developed, to the south it's developed. The draw of their parks is their serene and bucolic wild elements which will surely be lost if we allow a casino there. Drinking water in the Hudson Highlands, this is the water for the Ramapo River Basin. It's a watershed and drinking supply for millions of people downstream. Developing puts that at risk forever. You cannot mitigate the impacts on water considering that Sterling Forest and parts of Tuxedo is where a lot of this water originates.

Environmental and local resident opposition – there are multiple well-funded groups that oppose this project. Though I'm not a formal member of any opposition group, I do support their oppositions and will actively back their opposition for this project moving forward. I support the Palisades Interstate Park and their decision to refuse access through 106. Tuxedo town government, the town board was not a unanimous decision, there was a descending vote on the town board. Tuxedo Park, Village of Tuxedo Park was not a unanimous decision, 2 votes against. Tuxedo town government officials have acknowledged that in a request for written feedback regarding the casino proposal prior to voting to sending a letter in support of Genting, townspeople wrote e-mails 2 to 1 against sending the letter of support. Opposition in Tuxedo is strong and more opposition will continue to grow and develop if the proposed casino continues to be pursued. I thank you for hearing my comments and I thank you for your service to the people of New York.

Kevin Law: Thank you. Martin Lavenhar.

Martin Lavenhar: You're gonna love this cause it's going to be short. My name is Martin Lavenhar.

Kevin Law: Sorry about that, sorry I screwed up your name.

Martin Lavenhar: Pardon?

Kevin Law: I said I'm sorry I messed up your last name.

Martin Lavenhar: Everybody does. We've been, my wife and I have been Tuxedo residents for 35 years. I want to address the community support portion of your criteria for your decision of

where to place a casino in the New York metropolitan area. Greeting Tuxedo on the community acceptance 20% of your decision, we would have to give ourselves a grade of half. There's an increasing dissention in the town as evidenced in the number of signatures on recent petitions and increasing numbers of yellow shirts that you've seen at the hearings you've held. And I might add that none of the yellow shirts are hired guns. I voted for the Upstate New York Gaming and Economic Development Act. I believe that the trade off of the negative side of gambling revenue would be offset by the stated recovery of the disadvantaged New York State communities. I thought the operative words were upstate and Economic. And believed Governor Cuomo when he said, "Our focus has been to bring jobs and boost local economies in Upstate New York where decades of decline has taken their toll on our communities." Tuxedo, aside from being only almost upstate, has not suffered that toll. It is not distressed community, nor is it a town in dire need of revitalization. Tuxedo is not by any stretch of the imagination a down and out municipality. Yes there are those who would like to see casino generated revenue fill the town budget gap and to stabilize the school district financing, but that does not mean Tuxedo needs CPR like many Upstate communities do. To place the Genting Casino in Tuxedo would scrap the stated purpose of the Act, which is, as I understand it, is to revitalize the Catskills. To bring back tourism to a beautiful yet disheartened part of New York State. A casino in Tuxedo would act as a cannibal to the Catskill Renaissance and then in 7 years when the inevitable new world class New York City casinos come on line, Tuxedo and Orange County tax advantages would disappear. Sterling Forest State Park might be left at that point with a Letchworth Village sized parking lot as their neighbor. Do the right thing, put the casinos in the Catskills. Thank you.

Kevin Law: We now go back to the pre-registered list. Elaine Fetig

Elaine Fetig: Good evening. My name is Elaine Fetig and I am the co-chair of the Sullivan County Visitors Association and a director of the Roscoe Rocklin Chamber Board. I'd like to thank you for the opportunity to speak to you at this time when you're making such an important decision on where to site these casinos in New York State.

During this long day, you've heard a great deal about why the casinos should be placed in Sullivan County to help with our economic issues and also about how we've been working on this for a long time and how we are ready and able to go. I'd like to now tell you some other reasons that you should pick Sullivan County as the perfect choice for siting a casino or two and I'd like to do that by telling you about a story that happened in the county 3 years ago.

The town I come from, Roscoe, is a small town and when I say small I mean 600 people and an average graduating class from high school of 12 people. That is small. We also, though, besides the people have beautiful mountains, clean air and we have the world famous...

Kevin Law: Where is Roscoe?

Elaine Fetig: Roscoe is at the western point of Sullivan County.

Kevin Law: Oh the very northwest.

Elaine Fetig: Yep northwest. We also have the world famous Beaverkill and Willowemoc Rivers and we've been known as Trout Town USA for decades. In the year 2011 one of our residents heard about a contest that was being held by the World Fishing Network to decide the ultimate fishing town in the US. And the way to decide that was by opening it up to votes from people all over the United States. Go online and vote on who might become the ultimate fishing town. We decided to go into it. We became part of the test by people going in and putting us on the listing and then we started to vote and we voted against places like Montauk Point, San Diego, the Keys, places that were so much not in the same situation as we were that it almost seemed like we could never do it. In the end, after a month and a half of voting, we won by 30 points, a town of 600 people got 267,434 votes. You might ask me why I'm telling you this, what does this have to do with casinos? I think what it has to do with, when you understand how that happened, you can understand how that will help the casinos happen. People from all over the county got on their computers four times a day, sometimes in the middle of the night to help Roscoe vote for the ultimate fishing town. They weren't part of the town but they were part of the county, and therefore they felt it was something that they could take great pride in also. They told their family and friends to get on board and vote also, and in the last day or so of the contest, we lost our electricity, which is a big deal when you're down to the wire on something like this and people picked up their laptops and went to people who had electricity or generators. And again, you may say, "Why is she talking about this?" And the reason that I am is that can-do attitude that helped our little town win the Ultimate Fishing Town and money that helped us do things is the same kind of can-do attitude that will help Sullivan County. We are ready. We've been ready for a long time. We are anxious, our population has voted that they want to have this and that same can-do attitude that won the Ultimate Fishing Town hopefully will win the casinos but certainly will help them move forward.

And also, we have this wonderful natural beauty. So not only will you be placing these facilities in locations that people come to gamble in, but they'll be coming also to do a lot of the nature things. So one side attracts the others. The casinos attract people who are for gambling, and the nature attracts people for the beautiful things that can be done and also includes them in the gambling.

So as you make your difficult decision, please be reminded that placing these casinos within an area of beauty of its own will bring people to not only gamble but to share in all the other wonderful amenities and merits of Sullivan County and that's a win-win to all of us. Thank you.

Kevin Law: Thanks Elaine.

Elaine Fetig: No problem.

Kevin Law: Dan Johnson. Here comes the blue.

Dan Johnson: I'm the blue shirt today. Good evening my name is Danny Johnson. I come to you in unequivocal support for the Nevele Casino Resort and Spa project in Ellenville, New York. I am a town councilman in the town of Warsing. I'm a 56 year resident of the village of Ellenville. For my day job I am an Account Executive for HG Page Lumber Company here in Poughkeepsie, New York covering all of Ulster and Northern Dutchess County. I've been in this building materials business since I was 17 except for the 2 summers that I helped myself through school by working at the Falsie[sounds like] Hotel next to the Nevele as a bellhop. It was a very good experience. I've been fortunate enough to be relatively in the know regarding the Nevele Resort and Casino project since it's early inception. It's been an incredible, and at times miraculous journey. I started as a skeptic but was sold almost immediately. The genius of the Nevele project is simple and its fortuitous. There is to be no change in the footprint of the property. The total acreage of just over 500 acres, there is to be no increase in the square footage of the buildings on the site. There is no increase in the number of hotel rooms, and at the same time, there is no decrease in the incredible forever-wild component of this beautiful setting. We are the only project among any that I know that is going to repurpose 3 iconic Catskill resort buildings. That's recycling and it's environmentally friendly. While there are future huge plans for championship length golf course, as of now they're going to fix the great golf course that's already there. It's been dormant for 10 years. It was damaged by hurricane Irene and Lee but not destroyed. Also, fortuitous the village of Ellenville just completed a brand new \$35 million sewer plant renovation and it has lots of excess capacity and the tremendous village water supply is only half utilized and it's a 1/4 mile from the gate of the Nevele Hotel.

Our school buildings at one time supported 2500 students. We now have 1700 students at a brand new building. The Nevele project is the only planned casino that I know of proud enough to call itself what it is the Nevele. Not at the former site of blah, blah, blah or some other name. We as a town voted 2600 to 400 in favor of the casino amendment last fall. I heard the clever liberty guy this morning. I was watching it on the Internet with his top 10 reasons and I agree with about 7 1/2 to 8 of them. He claimed Ulster County is in great shape due to our great decrease in the percentage of unemployment but this must have been every other town in Ulster County. There really is a 0% unemployment in New Paltz and Woodstock and some other areas in our county that are fortunate. We are stuck in the high teens, around 18% and there's no end in sight. The Nevele project, while it is in Ulster County is 28 miles from Kingston, Saugerties, Woodstock and 22 miles from New Paltz where the unemployment is low. The Nevele is only 2 miles from the Sullivan County line to the south and 6 miles to the Sullivan County line to the west. The Ellenville School District has students from Mamakating, Fallsburg, and the town of Neversink in our population. They are Sullivan County towns. Even better, or much, much worse, we have 60% of our students in federally assisted school lunch programs. That's the shape that our town is in. It's a sad place to be the head of that class.

So, all of these projects we've talked about tonight are in a race, competition to be just to be approved. To begin a process. Let me tell you the Nevele isn't just in a race to be approved, we're at the starting line, our feet are in the starting blocks and all you have to do is pull the trigger on the starting gun and we're building. We're not applying and approving. Our final environmental impact statement is done. We rezoned the property for casino gambling, casino

resort. I guarantee you the Nevele will be the first one open and in operation. We need the intent and purpose of the referendum as passed in November to be followed and you will end unemployment in southern Ulster County.

By the way a bookend casino in Monticello is just fine with us in Ulster County. You couldn't do a better job than that. And I ask you as a Board, I really respect that you've already spent 11 hours and you're giving us time to speak, but as a councilman I can relate to some long meetings and I assume you're not doing this for the big bucks. I'm sure it's not a résumé enhancer. I've read your information. You can, however, make a huge difference, do the right thing and have a huge impact on tens of thousands of the good people in our county and in Sullivan County. You can maximize a positive impact on the most people by doing this.

Kevin Law: Dan times up.

Dan Johnson: Thank you.

Kevin Law: Thank you very much. Edward Goddell. Edward Goddell.

Edward Goddell: Right here.

Kevin Law: Any relation?

Edward Goddell: No. Could I grab this in my hand so I can and I apologize I can't show these in both directions but as I take them down I'll face them backwards. My name is Ed Goddell and I'm the Executive Director of the New York New Jersey Trail Conference. The New York New Jersey Trail Conference recruits, trains and oversees more than 1000 volunteers annually who work in parks. We have 10,000 individual members and about 97 organizational members. We work in 175 different park units in Northern New Jersey and the Hudson River Valley in 22 counties. We're the official steward of over 2000 miles of trails. We contribute about 75,000 hours per year of volunteer labor. We built the first section of the Appalachian Trail, we still maintain it. We built the other long distance trails in New York, the Long Path and the Highlands Trail, and we hold a conservation easement of 1400-acre conservation easement immediately adjacent to and will share a boundary with the Genting proposal.

I'm just saying this to say that I know trails. I know outdoor recreation. I know what that economy is like. And I should also say that I am only speaking about the 3 downstate Orange County casinos, that would be in Woodbury, Tuxedo and Blooming Grove.

Kevin Law: Could you move that closer to us?

Edward Goddell: This?

Kevin Law: Yes. Thank you.

Edward Goddell: Oops I'm out of cord here. Okay. So the 3 casinos I'm discussing are Tuxedo here, Woodbury here and Blooming Grove and really my analysis is mostly on these two but I do have a few little problems with that one as well.

The main thing that you can see is the greenbelt around New York City that serves over 22 million people and has been stitched together over the last 100 years and does a lot of things besides outdoor recreation in terms of water and so forth. These 2 casinos in particular are in it or immediately adjacent to it.

Kevin Law: That's Sterling Forest and Caesars?

Edward Goddell: Sterling Forest and Caesars in Woodbury yes. So, I'm here to say that the Gaming Economic Development will cannibalize the Outdoor Recreation Economic Development. And I should establish first, that economic development, excuse me, could you help me? Probably not. That the Outdoor Recreation Economy is actually huge. It's a sleeping giant. It's \$646 billion nationwide and here in New York it accounts for over \$33 billion of direct consumer spending and over 300,000 jobs including almost 3 billion in state and local taxes. So if we're impacting the Outdoor Recreation Economy, it's not a good thing. It's big and what this Committee of course needs to consider is the net economic impacts over the long-term. As we know casinos can fail in less than a decade but the park will take much longer to recover.

So I'm running out of time I'm not going to go into much detail here. But you see the Genting proposal, the Woodbury proposal and the Pin Cordish[sounds like] Proposal. These colors are where you will be able to see their development from when the leaves are off. When leaves are on, its more restricted to current viewpoints that vary in part and included on the Appalachian National Scenic Trail. The Caesars proposal, because it's a broader valley, you can see it for much more. These are all parklands, and this in fact is a trail which we would like to continue straight through here.

So, let me just, and then these are the tiny park roads that people use to hike and bike on that the 10 million people plus the 13 million at Woodbury Commons are going to be going through.

Let me just say that Governor Cuomo doesn't support inappropriate development on adjacent to State Parks. And I'll just read a quote from a letter on behalf of Andrew Cuomo where it stated, 'The proposed LG Office Tower presents a potentially damaging impact on the scenic wonder of the Palisades that has been appreciated and protected by generations. If constructed, the proposed tower would be incompatible with the surrounding natural landscape and would be visible for miles along the river.' That's what he said to LG, that's what I need you to say to Caesars and Genting. Thank you very much.

Kevin Law: I have a question for you. The proposals are next to but not in parklands?

Edward Goddell: Well they are not on parkland but this Genting is surrounded by parks and in fact Caesars is surrounded both across here and starting right here.

Kevin Law: We were told...

Edward Goddell: It shares a boundary with a park.

Kevin Law: A couple of weeks ago we were told that at least one of these proposals is proposed for land that was set aside locally for development.

Edward Goddell: Perhaps so but not development of this scale, that's the problem. It's the scale and the dice are loaded for the gaming companies that they have to build the biggest casino they can because of the 70% criteria. So they're not appropriate for parks.

Kevin Law: How far away from the parks does one have to be before somebody in your position finds it acceptable for them to be built?

Edward Goddell: Well, that is for the seeker process to figure out in detail. But I can tell you that these 2 immediately adjacent as Governor Cuomo said with the LG project in the Palisades Park is too close.

Kevin Law: Well nothing's getting built until the seeker process is followed by everybody.

Edward Goddell: But you could allow me and my volunteers to get to work on trails instead of fighting casinos if you make the decision at your level.

Kevin Law: I understand. But the seeker process is going to happen or there'll be no casino built on any site.

Edward Goddell: That's right and there's an extensive list for both of these.

Kevin Law: So citing the seeker process doesn't really answer the question of how far away one has to be before you feel that your trails that you're endeavoring to protect are...

Edward Goddell: Let me put it this way. The Nevele proposal is within viewpoint of a trail that we built and maintain. We are not directly opposing that proposal because that hotel has been there for as long as the trail.

Kevin Law: So preexisting building is okay?

Edward Goddell: Well, it's better, yes it's better and you know there's no clear line with these kinds of things but I can tell you from all of my experience that both of these projects cross the line.

Kevin Law: Are you going to provide us with those materials?

Edward Goddell: Yes I have them in small scale, I'll hand them off to someone. Thank you.

Kevin Law: Thank you Edward. Cynthia Serroca Dunn

Cynthia Serroca Dunn: Hi my name is Cynthia Serroca Dunn and I first would like a moment of silence for all the animals, plants and humans that will perish if the building of the casino in Harriman, New York or the surrounding area happens. And it's not funny.

I have been a resident of both New York and New Jersey. Harriman State Park has over 235 trails throughout it that thousands of people travel every few months with over 52,000 protected areas of wildlife. It is the second biggest state park in the state. This parks views and vistas needs to be protected.

Number 2, Sterling Forest – I have been writing letters and testified at hearings since I was in grammar school about Sterling Forest and saving it. It is the legacy of all the people that has fought through the years including former Senator Lowenburg, former Speaker of the House Newt Gingrich who pledged “to do something good for our children and grandchildren by preserving the land to be destroyed by a casino.” This is a disgrace. There are over 21,000 acres which have been saved from development. Even former Governor of New York, Mario Cuomo, supported preserving the forest. After New York and New Jersey spent 100 million plus to preserve Sterling Forest, a proposal to build a resort and casino I fear this casino will threaten and hurt New Jersey northern drinking water. The Wanaque reservoir provides drinking water for 2 million people and is right next to this area. The run off from the construction alone will be devastating.

Number 3, Woodbury Commons – has the President of any of these casinos taken a drive through the area on Sunday? Well, if you're trying to get to this area when the stores open and close you will be faced with all kinds of traffic. What will it do to the area to have a casino? The traffic alone will make me want to alter my plans for traveling up the New York State Thruway which I often go on weekends to find somewhere else to go. This is the worst area to put a casino. The environmental impacts, the traffic impact, the local impact, the quality of life impact makes this location the worst in the state. Do you think that this is not going to affect our air? Air pollution has gotten worse over the years and so has asthma and respiratory diseases, especially in children. Why air pollution? Building a casino will add to the air pollution of the area and how about flooding issues? Don't you know that the trees keep our areas protected from run-off from the surrounding mountains and flooding. How about when these trees are gone from the area and now the local businesses and home flood because of this proposal. What are they thinking? They aren't. My suggestion would be to go to some of the old hotels in the Catskill Mountains like the Nevele and to revamp them and create the casinos out of them. These areas of depressed and need the income and the traffic. Do not allow a group to come into this area that don't care about the infrastructure, doesn't care about the animals, doesn't care about the people in New York or New Jersey, doesn't care about anything except the almighty

dollar. I would also add to this, look at the casinos in Atlantic City. They are going and closing one by one and how is this going to affect the casinos in this area? Also think of the projects and how they will be done. Investigate what New Jersey was promised by all of the casinos and all the tax payers and how much money our taxes are and our schools are because the casinos were supposed to pay for some of the off-ramp with the schools, and we've never, ever gotten a dime from those casinos to help out the tax payers of New Jersey. Don't you think that it's going to be the same in New York? I ask you please, put these casinos in places that already have buildings that need them. Thank you.

Kevin Law: Thank you. Dennis Leahy.

Dennis Leahy: Good evening.

Kevin Law: Hi Dennis.

Dennis Leahy: Hello how are you. My name is Dennis Leahy. I'm going to hold this, my name is Dennis Leahy and I'm the Mayor of the Village of Maybrook and I support Gentings Resorts World Hudson Valley Project. One common theme here today is the shared passion about bringing economic change for dying businesses and distressed communities in the entire region. Because the need is to great, all the supporters here are willing to say why the project in their backyard is the best no matter what the actual studies say and no matter what the bidders actually put in their applications. Heck, I have an elementary school in my village that I have vowed to reopen for my residents. I could rehash how badly we need this, but I think you get that. Everyone here is assuming that a casino is actually a good and appropriate way to do economic development. The problem is that there is no basis for the assumption unless you have a top-notch site which Montgomery is and a finally strong company that can actually build and operate something that will prosper. In 2012 a huge resort was built in Atlantic City with all the economic promises that you've heard here today. That casino has already closed its doors and just 3 years later and all the promises were broken with thousands now out of work. Don't let that happen here. We can't let that happen to us. We can't let rhetoric substitute for the facts. The Location Board has one chance to get this right and unproven promises won't cut it. You need a strongly financed with proven success in New York and Genting is the only company bidding in the Orange County who can bring it to the table. I appreciate the fact that you're letting everyone's voices be heard, but the actual selection should boil down to 3 facts: Genting number 1, will bring more people and money to the state. Number 2, they offer higher wages and they are the only bidder willing to pay a real living wage averaging over \$60,000. Number 3, they will last longer with no debt weighing them down. And you have a tangible evidence of that. In just 3 years they took a Queens facility that many casino companies in here ignored and turned it into the highest grossing and highest paying casino in the entire United States. You have the studies, the numbers and the real facts in the applications that you've received. Please make your recommendation based on facts not rhetoric. Who is best positioned to do this right and last long enough to fulfill their promises? Only Genting who has given \$1.2 billion to New York in just 3 years.

Five key points I'd like to touch on: Number 1, the biggest investment. Number 2, most living wage jobs. Number 3, highest pay. Number 4, no opposition. Number 5, no traffic issues. We're ready now in Montgomery and we want it. The state is counting on you. The entire Hudson Valley, the town of Montgomery, the villages of Montgomery, Walden and Maybrook and my elementary school are counting on you. Thank you for giving me this opportunity this evening.

Kevin Law: Okay back to the other list of people who signed up. David Rosenberg.

David Rosenberg: Thank you for your patience and attention. I didn't need to shave when I came here this morning, I need to shave now but, you guys must need a shower too but thank you so much.

I had been a member of the Village Board for 12 years and also served as Mayor for a relatively short time.

Kevin Law: Of what community?

David Rosenberg: The village of Monticello, until the voters decided I shouldn't be involved in politics locally anymore.

I'm here in support of the two concord projects. I don't have any professional relationship with them except I do have a membership to the Players Club for Mohegan Sun at Pocono Downs and when I do go there, at my request they do provide me with virgin pina colodas with whipped cream so I don't know if that counts to have a relationship with them. I'm a lifelong Monticello resident having been born in the old Monticello hospital in 1953. Back then Monticello was the long time county seat for Sullivan County. It had 2 hospitals. It's been 40 years since that was the case. I'm here today to advocate in the strongest possible terms respectfully for the granting of 2 casino licenses for the two distinct projects that would be housed on the contiguous concord property as it is widely know. The adage that the whole is greater than the sum of it's parts could never be more accurate if this would occur. It's impossible to overstate what the Concord meant to Monticello, the town of Thompson in Sullivan County. It's also not possible to fully describe with the demise of the great resorts of the Catskills has meant in economic and psychological terms. The day that it is announced that both licenses are being granted here in Thompson, there would be an unparalleled and unprecedented rush of investments and a resurgence of hope and optimism unseen in my lifetime. You would be hard pressed to find any doctor or dentist, accountant or engineer, TV writer or movie producer or corporate CEO of a certain age in the metropolitan region of New York City that does not have a real and emotional connection to the Catskills which incidentally does not begin until you drive through Orange County. Upstate begins north of the Orange County border. The intent and the spirit of the referendum and the current legislation concerning the placement of these proposed casinos was never ever intended to include Orange County. Orange County is blessed with great natural beauty and a vibrant economy as well. I urge this commission to dismiss without prejudice any and all proposals that are not from either Sullivan or Ulster County. There could be no doubt that this was and is the

intent of the legislation. I'm not here to address the merits of anyone particular proposal but rather to talk about the importance and power of the creation of even one job. This March will be 20 years since I first became a New York State registered architect. I was able and fortunate enough to attend the State University of New York at Buffalo to obtain both an undergraduate and graduate degree in architecture. I earned the money I needed to attend college by driving a garbage truck for the better part of 7 years in the town of Thompson. Don't ever say there is such a thing as a menial or unimportant job. I also worked two winters at the Concord Ski area. The pay was \$7 a day the first year and \$8 a day for the second year and I was glad to have the job. I also worked 2 summers after high school at the Monticello Raceway as a food vendor. We had to be finger printed and we had to join the Hotel Worker's Union and also those jobs were very highly sought after by everybody locally. But the job I really want to discuss was my dad's. He passed away in 1974. He sold life insurance and growing up he was never home on a Sunday afternoon. It was only as I got older did I know that my dad spent every Sunday afternoon at the Concord Hotel. Most of his clients made their living from the hotel and Sunday afternoon after check out, was their payday. My dad insured many of the executives, managers and the real heart and soul of any Catskill Resort, the waitresses and waiters, bus boys, bellhops, kitchen staff and so on. He worked with them to make sure that policies were in force and that their families would also be protected. Even today I can drive down almost any street in Monticello and any streets and roads in the town of Thompson and point out the houses, empty lots and vacant stores and describe the people and families who lived there and their connection to the Concord and the other grand resorts that are quickly fading into memory. I close in urging you to give the mountains its best chance ever to rise from the ashes, literally and reclaim their rightful and historic prominence in our great Empire State. Thank you gentleman so much for your time.

Kevin Law: Thank you David. Next up is Yakov Sullivan. Yakov Sullivan, no? Hey folks we need to take the conversations out into the hallway so you can hear your neighbors and your colleagues speak please. Next up is Spartak Getchy. Spar, thank you. Can we please be quiet in the back.

Spartak Getchy: Good evening.

Kevin Law: Hi Spartak.

Spartak Getchy: I'm here on behalf of Mike Torgiana. Reading verbatim what he wrote. He actually had to leave for a family cause about an hour ago.

"My name is Mike Torgiana from Sterling Forest. I'm married and have a 1-year-old baby girl.

Kevin Law: Mike, Mike, hold on one second. For the last time, can please people take their conversations out. Show some respect for the people who are speaking. They've waited all day to be heard, let's make sure we hear them. Sorry Michael try again. Or sorry Spartak.

Spartak Getchy: I live right across the street from the proposed Sterling Forest Casino. My family and I fully support the casino proposal. I live so close I can throw a baseball from my driveway and hit the site and I don't have a good throwing arm.

Some background on myself. I lived in Brooklyn for most of my life in a rough neighborhood. Each summer my parents would send me to my uncle's house in Orange County to get away from the concrete jungle. I always wanted to raise a family in Orange County. It took me 17 years of savings to realize my dream. My dream is now in jeopardy. This spring my local school taxes were increased 41%. A 41% increase I cannot afford. It has been stated today Tuxedo is prosperous and doesn't need this casino. If so prosperous why tax my middle class family an additional 41%? I fear for the middle class of Tuxedo like my family because we are in jeopardy. In fact with no businesses moving into Tuxedo and nonprofits, I'm sorry, and no businesses moving into Tuxedo and non-for-profits moving in, my feeling is that taxes will only be raised again. New York State needs this casino, Orange County needs this casino, Tuxedo needs this casino.

To the opposition from the gated community of Tuxedo Park which is not even close to the site, did you take the day off, lose wages today? Because I did. Not all of Tuxedo is independently wealthy. Don't let their stats fool you. I went to the meetings and saw overwhelming support for this project. Unfortunately most of them could not be here because they have families to support. The opposition here today are not the majority. Kudos to Tuxedo supervisor Mike Ross who stood up to the select few. I would not want to be called the names you were called on that evening. I'm not here to give you stats, I'm here to give you a real life example of how Tuxedo needs this casino. The environment also needs this casino. I drive by the dilapidated water facility every day. Genting has proposed a state of the art facility how about that for preserving the environment?

In closing, my family will be directly impacted by this casino due to the close proximity but we are in full support. Genting has a global reach to help solve a local problem. I trust in the commission to do the right thing for my family and for so many more like mine. Let's not let New Jersey take our tax revenue. Once again, we are in support of the Sterling Forest Casino and thank you to Mohegan Sun for the paper.

Kevin Law: Thank you. Walter Kittle.

Walter Kittle: Hi how ya doing?

Kevin Law: Hi Walter.

Walter Kittle: Yeah. What a day we had. We got to hear both sides present their arguments, speak their mind. The reason why that is possible is because of the men and women today and who have worn the uniform of our great country. My name is Walter Kittle. I live in Warwick, New York and I'm here in support of the casino in Sterling Forest.

Just a brief background on myself. Last year I retired after 32 years of military service. I did 3 tours in Iraq, 1 tour in Afghanistan and I'm inducted into the Veterans Hall of Fame. The other night I had the privilege of speaking to the Chairman and members of the Board for the casino and they guaranteed me that Veterans will have priority to work in their casino. They said the priorities are going to go to veterans, locals, if you're a local veteran you basically got it made with them. With the men and women serving in Iraq today and in Afghanistan we have a high unemployment rate and to have a veteran friendly community and company will greatly help us that return from overseas. Especially now, lastly they launched more air strikes against Syria so the veteran community is going to keep growing and growing and to have a company that totally supports veterans is good for the environment and the whole community is what we need down there. Thank you.

Kevin Law: Thank you. Folks I'm just going to suggest one thing, just as Walter just did, we have two and a half pages of speakers that we're not going to get to in 25 minutes. But I'd like to get to as many as we can. We've heard so much today and so rather than repeating what may have been said by some of your colleagues or your neighbors, if I could suggest I call your name, you come up, you say which project you're for or against, at least we'll have it on the record and we'll get to as many of you as we can. If you could honor that I'm not going to insist on it but if you can honor that it would allow your neighbors to speak. And then for all those who we don't get to, we're going to be taking written comments as well. So with that suggestions let's see how it work. Mary Yazzary. Oh are you Steve Gross? You'll go next Steve. Before I opened my mouth I checked your name off because I was about to call you up but then I made my suggestion. So that's why I went to the next one so I'll call you next. Mary.

Mary Yazzary: Ah I'm Mary Yazzary and I live in Tuxedo. I'm going, I have a fairly brief talk here. I'm a founding and current Board member of Sterling Forest Partnership but I address this Board as an individual speaking for myself. I believe a little history would be helpful here. Sterling Forest Partnership is the grassroots outgrowth of 20+ year's effort to preserve Sterling Forest from development for 35,000 people. Pockets of homes, commercial development and roadways were to be spread throughout the 20,000 acres of woodland, steep slopes, stream valleys, wetlands and varied habitats. This was an admirable development model but it was completely altered, it would completely alter these wooded hillsides and natural communities that had been reclaimed by nature after clear cutting and being abandoned in the middle 1800s by black industrial art of iron mining and smelting. It has since provided proved to be home to the second most diverse flora and fauna in New York State and designated an important bird area by the Audubon Society. It was always my understanding that grassroots organizations are made up of individuals with a passion, a need to defend an ideal and to make a difference. Since it's beginning Sterling Forest Partnership's ideal has been the protection of the natural values that Sterling Forest now state park and it's surrounding areas represent. The partnership has traditionally been called upon to partner with like-minded institutions, higher experts with a science-based understanding of the issues and to provide focus and direction to achieve a common goal. Today that focus is to counter the Genting Group's proposed Sterling Forest Resort development in Tuxedo. Many of us consider this will be a major intrusion to the wellbeing of the state park. To this end the Partnership has engaged with past and recent

advocates, supporters and allies to once again help with their expertise and concerns about protecting the integrity of a forest so many people fought for and that the federal government and state of New York and New Jersey and so on spent over \$100 million dollars. This country created the concept of preserving open space and its natural wonders in public parks for all its citizens and future generations to enjoy. The voices you've heard here from our group and in the many letters and e-mails you have received against the location of this proposed casino development are not just from a handful of nimbis in the northern end of Tuxedo. We represent earnest environment and social concerns for the value of the state park, the town of Tuxedo and the integrity of this entire region that thousands of people support and now value as respite from urbanism and sprawl within an hour of New York City. Genting's proposal admirable as it may be elsewhere is simply too big, ill conceived, inappropriate, environmentally intrusive and unwelcome in this location. I also fear an abandoned thousand room hotel elephant, white elephant and theme park in the next few years when casino's elsewhere take the bloom off this rose. I therefore strongly encourage and support the Sterling Forest Partnership to use all legal means to thwart this development and I implore the Gaming Commission not to approve siting this casino dressed as a family friendly resort in the town of Tuxedo. Thank you.

Kevin Law: Steve.

Steve Gross: Hi my name is Steve Gross and I'm the Principal of Hudson Highland's Environmental Consulting. Over the past year and a half my colleagues and I have had the opportunity to review 5 of the casino proposals on behalf of four separate clients. Two of these applications are well developed and have gone through a completed seeker process, the other three are still in a constant state of flux with design details changing day to day and are only at the beginning of their environmental review. Without completed seeker reviews for all 9 sites its apparent that the Board will be making their decision absent potentially critical information. But having conducted countless man-hours of environmental analysis of more than half of the proposals before you, I would like to share some observations with you today.

In general, the greatest potential environmental impact comes from the two most southern applications, Genting Sterling Forest Resort and Caesars in Woodbury. Both of these applications are situated immediately within or adjacent to parkland within the Palisade Interstate Park System. You have already heard about the unavoidable impacts in Sterling Forest State Park, a location I believe is so environmentally sensitive that it should have been dismissed from the outset. I was going to provide some of my own comments on this application today but I think the unanimous votes of both PIPSY and now as of yesterday, the New Jersey State Senate against this proposal says more than I possibly could. Suffice it to say that there are good reasons why more than \$100 million was spent collectively by the states of New York and New Jersey, multiple land trust organizations and the federal government to preserve Sterling Forest. They all recognize the extraordinary value of this land and the Ramapo watershed and protecting drinking water supplies, wild life habitat and open space. And these same arguments can be applied to the immediately joining Harriman State Park which despite its different name comprises the same unbroken forest, the same watershed, the same wildlife habitat. The Cesar site in Woodbury borders directly on Harriman State Park to the west with other sections of the

park in close proximity to the south and east. In fact the proposed entrance road and traffic lights for Caesars are immediately adjacent to Harriman State Park precisely at the location of one or two historic houses that are managed by the Orange County Historical Society. Currently, these houses sit in a rural and wooded setting. The new entranceway and traffic light and 6 lanes across route 17 would permanently diminish their historic and cultural value. Likewise as the site is situated directly on the headwaters of the Ramapo River, any impacts of increased run off and road related contaminants would have an even more direct and immediate effect on the Ramapo River than what happens in Sterling Forest. The Cesar site is also directly situated on top of sand gravel deposits that can act as a conduit of any contaminants directly into the underlying sole source aquifer.

Again, like Sterling Forest Casino the proposed 135-foot tall Caesars Hotel and Casino complex would be visible from a number of trails throughout Harriman State Park including the storied Appalachian Trail. Not only is this trail protected as a designated national scenic trail, but the very section of the trail that would be impacted by views of Caesars casino has a particular historic significance at being the very first official section of the Appalachian Trail from Bear Mountain to Arden dedicated in 1923. Caesars also intends to build on an abandoned section of the Erie Railroad main line to remove its associated railroad bridge from over Route 17. Nearby the Woodbury site, this same railroad right of way has been converted to the Orange Heritage Trail, and extremely popular linear park use for jogging, biking and walking. Plans call for the extension of the park from Hollows, New York to Harriman. There now exists a significant opportunity to extend the trail over the railroad bridge a short distance further to the Harriman Train Station where it would exponentially increase the value of the trail by opening it up to users who could bring their bikes by train from as far away as New York City. But the removal of the bridge and the construction of the Caesars Hotel on the right-of-way would eliminate this potential forever.

Gentlemen, you have already received testimony for the majority of casino applicants that awarding a license to either of these casinos will have a fatal effect on the possibility of a second casino location to the north. I can add to that my professional assessment that these two southern Orange County casinos also present the greatest potential and environmental impact. Further, I think that its tough to argue that the town of Tuxedo with an average household income of more than \$127,000 per year and remarkably low unemployment needs the economic stimulation that casino legislation was meant to provide. Nor that Woodbury, with its ever-expanding Woodbury Commons, Woodbury Center Shopping Mall and other large commercial developments is lacking in either job generators or tax ratables. These casino projects are best situated where they were originally intended...

Kevin Law: Times up.

Steve Gross: ...in the now depressed Catskills developed on the sites of preexisting resorts, this is where they will have the least adverse environmental impact and the greatest beneficial economic impact. By the way I can also answer a question that you posed earlier about

Kevin Law: Your time is up.

Steve Gross: Okay but if you want answer to a question...

Kevin Law: Just submit it. We're going to take submissions.

Steven Gross: Okay.

Kevin Law: Karen Murphy Doer, Doer.

Karen Murphy Doer: I am not going to repeat what my neighbors said. I just wanted to touch on a couple of highlights that have not been spoken to. I'm sure you've heard of the Doppler Effect, but have you ever heard of the Doppler effect? That is the tendency of stupid ideas to look smarter the faster they come at you. Genting has produced these gigantic pie in the sky dreams and they, I'm sure mean well by them, but I don't believe that they can come and actually build 1.37 million square feet in under 2 years. They can't even get a bridge built from the thruway interchange. We were promised by our town's board that if they did not have a bridge, they would not be able to build the resort.

And just for my Sterling Forest \$75,000 a year cohorts, I would like to give you a simple mathematical equation to explain why an average salary of \$55,000 is what Genting's website says is not really as great as it sounds. If you combine 4 highly compensated executive salaries of \$250,000 a year with 25 people making \$10 an hour, you come out with an average compensation of \$56,000 a year. Those 25 people making \$20,000 a year are the very people Genting has in mind when they say they will employ people from economically disadvantaged areas who will have to travel 30 to 60 minutes at an anticipated cost of \$10,000 a year. This is in their Executive Summary. People from Sullivan and Ulster Counties that this law was intended to create jobs for, Orange County is already slated to receive the lion share of the gaming revenue tax and stands to double it's money at the cost of the dying Catskill Resorts and the real Upstate Counties. And I say real Upstate Counties because I'm from Ithaca and you can ask them tomorrow where Upstate is. Thank you very much.

Kevin Law: Thank you. Tom Costa. Tom Costa. Sorry Tom.

Tom Costa: Gentleman, welcome to the Hudson Valley, I appreciate your patience. It's been a long day. I'll try to be brief. I own a World Class Fine Dining Restaurant in Newburg which for the last 35 years and I tend to take a more national look on things. 30 years ago the Hudson Valley was backwater. Since then, we have seen in the last 30 years an improvement a beginning of sort of panache branding of the Hudson Valley starting with the CIA coming in and the development of local sources. Back in the 90s when we named local sources on our menu. There was Coach Farms, Millbrook Venison and Hudson Valley Foie Gras. Nowadays there's a plethora of local sources and we are known nationwide. I was recently in Napa Valley and they were very proudly serving Hudson Valley Foie Gras on the menu. If you go in restaurants from Beijing to Brussels you'll see little bottles of Hudson Valley Baby Bourbon and it's usually the

most expensive bourbon that they have. So we have seen the valley develop, develop tourism. We now get fishing tourism in the springtime for bass season. We have boats, tour boats, cruise ships go up and down the Hudson in the spring and the fall, and of course, we have the historical sites. What we are lacking in the Hudson Valley would be a destination resort. So there are 2 things. My son lives...

Kevin Law: Sir, we're 2 minutes in and I don't know which casino you're talking about.

Tom Costa: Well I'm more, I'm not shilling for any particular casino. I like the Sterling Forest option where you revive the Sterling Forest Gardens and there are 2 things that the high end Asians look for. My son is an analyst over in China. They like buying brand name consumer goods and they like gambling. So that seems to be a good site for me but I would also like to see something in the Newburg area along the I84, I87 corridor. The bulk of my business comes on the weekends from travelers now and they're coming across the I84, I87 corridor. So much like Foxwoods and Mohegan Sun in Connecticut, having two casinos would benefit each other rather than detract from each other and would be drawing different crowds. So, anyway that's my comments on it.

Kevin Law: Good points, thanks. Gerald Palla. Gerald. Reverend Julius Collins.

Reverend Julius Collins: Good evening gentlemen and it's an honor to be able to speak with you. I intend to come from a different direction. I come from a different direction because as I've sat here since 8:00 this morning listening, I hear, I am a transplanted New Yorker. I'm a Texan but I've been in New York since 1980. I've been a part of Newburg. I'm now a part of Ellenville, town of Warsing and the County of Ulster. And because of that I come at you differently. As I look at you tonight, as I've been looking at you all day, you are like the emergency room doctors and you have 3 patients that have come into your emergency room. One of them I will consider has a fat red finger and 2 of them are badly hemorrhaging legs. Their legs are bleeding profusely while a finger drips. Why would I say that, because in an emergency room you have to look at who comes and then you have to treat according to the most severe down to the least severe. So, when you stop and look at it, I stop and look at this as a New Yorker I believe that in order to lift New York when all of this started, it started because there were places that were hemorrhaging with a loss over a long period of time. When you look at Sullivan County, when you look at parts of Ulster County, they've been hurting for years. I love, and I hate to be one to make a choice between any of them because I believe that the health of everyone of them lifts New York, but when you look at it, there are those that have been below because they have not had the numbers. There are those that have been below because of what they built their lives around disappeared. When the resorts started to disappear it took Sullivan County and Ulster County down to a dip, especially our part of Ulster County. We have a hotel that is the Queen of all when anywhere you go in this world, somebody will tell you something about the Nevele. Somebody will tell you that they're waiting and looking to come back to the Nevele. She's hurting, she's died. Now there's an attempt to bring her back and I believe that the intent of all of this legislation was to revive so that you heal the wounds of those that are hemorrhaging worse. And without that you defeat the whole purpose of what all of this

is about. I ask you tonight to consider that when you look at this, you look at the Nevele and you see a body working to overcome. We are a battling community, we battle for everything that we need. We battle, we want the Nevele standing tall because it will revise and we don't take it as an end product, we take the Nevele as being that shot in the arm that begins the healing process for our community. That shot that will get our legs strong enough that as we work through with the Nevele it will draw others that will not only want to open business, but will want to live and revive our community. And we believe that the Nevele and Sullivan County, we forget as we're having this discussion. I've sat here all day and I believe Sullivan County forgot that we work together to get it to a point to where somebody would say there should be two. We joined hands to get to that point. Now we get to a point to where we're looking away, but now we need to join hands and know that between the Nevele and Sullivan County we need this in order to put us, and because if you do it New York will be healthy. Thank you.

Kevin Law: Thank you Reverend. Thank you Reverend. Do you have a question?

Dennis Glazer: Yeah, I just want to say generally as we're about to conclude at 8:00 I want to thank everybody for coming and staying to the extent you've been here a long time and just let you know that this group, these 5 people, I'll talk about the other 4 are smart, quality people trying to do the right thing. Whatever else you can hear about or think about this group and the role that we have and the task we've been assigned, there's nothing but good faith. There's nothing but people who are trying to do the right thing, whatever that is. And you will get answers, not everybody is going to be happy, in fact I think the process is wired so that a majority, an overwhelming majority of communities and people have to be unhappy, but what you'll get is our best work, our best effort and we'll try to do the right thing as we see it. These are good people to do it and I just want you to know that because some people like to suggest that there's bad faith or bad motives. There's none of that going on. This is a clean and clear process, and unlike sometimes as these things in government go, these are people who are doing an enormous amount of work to try to get to the right answer. And we very much appreciate the input that you've given us today, that we got yesterday and hopefully we'll have as good a group to give us input tomorrow as well. So I thank you for that.

Kevin Law: Thank you Dennis. Just a couple of follow up words and just something about the process since I know you're all anxious as to what's going on next.

First, anybody who didn't get a chance to speak tonight can submit testimony to us on the Gaming Commission Website. We've heard over 250 people in the first 2 days. We have another 12 hours in Ithaca tomorrow where we'll hear from the Southern tier folks on their proposals. And the game plan after that, well let me just follow Dennis, I want to thank you all for showing respect for each other and for us for these since 8:00 this morning. It's been a long day for all of us. This was valuable to hear and to learn about your communities and your concerns and so that was important.

In terms of the process, we are throughout the month of October we'll be reviewing not only the testimony of everything we've heard, we will be doing additional due diligence on all of the

information that the applicant's have submitted and we are gearing ourselves up to make a decision and a recommendation sometime in the month of October. But to the extent we need more information or we need a little bit more time and if it segways a couple of days or a couple of weeks, we're not going to rush it. But we are gearing ourselves up, tomorrow is the last day of public hearings. We'll entertain written comments for a short period of time after that. Do we have a date for written comments?

Male: 7 days beyond today.

Kevin Law: 7 days beyond today for written comments and again we thank you all for coming out and have a safe ride home.